

Atomic Cut-Introduction (and Proof Compression) by Resolution: Preliminary Investigations

Bruno Woltzenlogel Paleo

Theoretische Informatik und Logik
Institut für Computersprachen
Technische Universität Wien

2009, July 2nd

- Cut-Elimination by Resolution
- Atomic-Cut-Introduction by Resolution

Cut-Elimination by Resolution

An Example

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\frac{P(u) \vdash P(u) \quad Q(u) \vdash Q(u)}{P(u), P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash Q(u)}{\rightarrow_l}}{P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash P(u) \rightarrow Q(u)}{\rightarrow_r}}{P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash \exists y(P(u) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\exists_r}}{\frac{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \exists y(P(u) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\forall_l}}{\frac{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \forall x \exists y(P(x) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\forall_r}} \quad \frac{\frac{\frac{\frac{P(a) \vdash P(a) \quad Q(v) \vdash Q(v)}{P(a), P(a) \rightarrow Q(v) \vdash Q(v)}{\rightarrow_l}}{P(a) \rightarrow Q(v) \vdash P(a) \rightarrow Q(v)}{\rightarrow_r}}{P(a) \rightarrow Q(v) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\exists_r}}{\frac{\exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\exists_l}}{\frac{\forall x \exists y(P(x) \rightarrow Q(y)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\forall_l}} \quad \frac{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \forall x \exists y(P(x) \rightarrow Q(y)) \quad \forall x \exists y(P(x) \rightarrow Q(y)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))}{cut}$$

Cut-Elimination by Resolution

An Example

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{P(u) \vdash P(u) \quad Q(u) \vdash Q(u)}{P(u), P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash Q(u)} \rightarrow_l \\
 \frac{P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash P(u) \rightarrow Q(u)}{P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash \exists y(P(u) \rightarrow Q(y))} \rightarrow_r \\
 \frac{P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash \exists y(P(u) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \exists y(P(u) \rightarrow Q(y))} \exists_r \\
 \frac{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \exists y(P(u) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \forall x \exists y(P(x) \rightarrow Q(y))} \forall_l \\
 \frac{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \forall x \exists y(P(x) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \forall_r \\
 \\
 \frac{P(a) \vdash P(a) \quad Q(v) \vdash Q(v)}{P(a), P(a) \rightarrow Q(v) \vdash Q(v)} \rightarrow_l \\
 \frac{P(a) \rightarrow Q(v) \vdash P(a) \rightarrow Q(v)}{P(a) \rightarrow Q(v) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \rightarrow_r \\
 \frac{P(a) \rightarrow Q(v) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \exists_r \\
 \frac{\exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\forall x \exists y(P(x) \rightarrow Q(y)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \exists_l \\
 \frac{\forall x \exists y(P(x) \rightarrow Q(y)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \forall_l \text{ cut}
 \end{array}$$

$$S_\varphi \equiv (\neg P(u) \otimes Q(u)) \oplus (P(a) \oplus \neg Q(v))$$

$$C_\varphi^W \equiv \{P(u) \vdash Q(u) ; \vdash P(a) ; Q(v) \vdash\}$$

$$\frac{\frac{\vdash P(a) \quad P(u) \vdash Q(u)}{\vdash Q(a)} R \quad Q(v) \vdash R}{\vdash} R$$

Cut-Elimination by Resolution

An Example

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{P(u) \vdash P(u) \quad Q(u) \vdash Q(u)}{P(u), P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash Q(u)} \rightarrow_l \\
 \frac{P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash P(u) \rightarrow Q(u)}{P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash \exists y(P(u) \rightarrow Q(y))} \rightarrow_r \\
 \frac{P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash \exists y(P(u) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \exists y(P(u) \rightarrow Q(y))} \exists_r \\
 \frac{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \exists y(P(u) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \forall x \exists y(P(x) \rightarrow Q(y))} \forall_l \\
 \frac{\forall x \exists y(P(x) \rightarrow Q(y)) \vdash \forall x \exists y(P(x) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \forall_r \\
 \frac{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \forall x \exists y(P(x) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \text{cut}
 \end{array}$$

$$\frac{\frac{\vdash P(a) \quad P(u) \vdash Q(u)}{\vdash Q(a)} R \quad Q(v) \vdash R}{\vdash} R$$

$\llbracket \varphi \rrbracket_{\vdash P(a)}^O :$

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{P(a) \vdash P(a)}{P(a) \vdash P(a), Q(v)} w_r}{\vdash P(a), P(a) \rightarrow Q(v)} \rightarrow_r}{\vdash P(a), \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \exists_r$$

Cut-Elimination by Resolution

An Example

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{P(u) \vdash P(u) \quad Q(u) \vdash Q(u)}{P(u), P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash Q(u)} \rightarrow_l \\
 \frac{P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash P(u) \rightarrow Q(u)}{P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash \exists y(P(u) \rightarrow Q(y))} \rightarrow_r \\
 \frac{P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash \exists y(P(u) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \exists y(P(u) \rightarrow Q(y))} \exists_r \\
 \frac{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \exists y(P(u) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \forall x \exists y(P(x) \rightarrow Q(y))} \forall_l \\
 \frac{\forall x \exists y(P(x) \rightarrow Q(y)) \vdash \forall x \exists y(P(x) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \forall_r \\
 \frac{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \forall x \exists y(P(x) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \text{cut}
 \end{array}$$

$$\frac{\frac{\vdash P(a) \quad P(u) \vdash Q(u)}{\vdash Q(a)} R \quad Q(v) \vdash R}{\vdash} R$$

$\llbracket \varphi \rrbracket_{Q(v) \vdash}^O :$

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{Q(v) \vdash Q(v)}{Q(v), P(a) \vdash Q(v)} w_l}{Q(v) \vdash P(a) \rightarrow Q(v)} \rightarrow_r}{Q(v) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \exists_r$$

Cut-Elimination by Resolution

An Example

$$\frac{
 \frac{
 \frac{
 \frac{P(u) \vdash P(u) \quad Q(u) \vdash Q(u)}{P(u), P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash Q(u)}{\rightarrow_l}
 }{P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash P(u) \rightarrow Q(u)}{\rightarrow_r}
 }{P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash \exists y(P(u) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\exists_r}
 }{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \exists y(P(u) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\forall_l}
 }{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \forall x \exists y(P(x) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\forall_r}
 }{
 \frac{
 \frac{
 \frac{
 \frac{P(a) \vdash P(a) \quad Q(v) \vdash Q(v)}{P(a), P(a) \rightarrow Q(v) \vdash Q(v)}{\rightarrow_l}
 }{P(a) \rightarrow Q(v) \vdash P(a) \rightarrow Q(v)}{\rightarrow_r}
 }{P(a) \rightarrow Q(v) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\exists_r}
 }{\exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\exists_l}
 }{\forall x \exists y(P(x) \rightarrow Q(y)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\forall_l}
 }{cut}
 }{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))}$$

$$\frac{
 \frac{\vdash P(a) \quad P(u) \vdash Q(u)}{\vdash Q(a)} R
 }{\vdash Q(v)} R$$

$\llbracket \varphi \rrbracket_{P(u) \vdash Q(u)}^{\circ}$:

$$\frac{
 \frac{
 \frac{P(u) \vdash P(u) \quad Q(u) \vdash Q(u)}{P(u), P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash Q(u)}{\rightarrow_l}
 }{P(u), \forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash Q(u)}{\forall_l}
 }{P(u) \vdash Q(u)}$$

Cut-Elimination by Resolution

An Example

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{P(u) \vdash P(u) \quad Q(u) \vdash Q(u)}{P(u), P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash Q(u)} \rightarrow_I \\
 \frac{P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash P(u) \rightarrow Q(u)}{P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash \exists y(P(u) \rightarrow Q(y))} \rightarrow_r \\
 \frac{P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash \exists y(P(u) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \exists y(P(u) \rightarrow Q(y))} \exists_r \\
 \frac{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \exists y(P(u) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \forall x \exists y(P(x) \rightarrow Q(y))} \forall_I \\
 \frac{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \forall x \exists y(P(x) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \forall_r
 \end{array}
 \qquad
 \begin{array}{c}
 \frac{P(a) \vdash P(a) \quad Q(v) \vdash Q(v)}{P(a), P(a) \rightarrow Q(v) \vdash Q(v)} \rightarrow_I \\
 \frac{P(a) \rightarrow Q(v) \vdash P(a) \rightarrow Q(v)}{P(a) \rightarrow Q(v) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \rightarrow_r \\
 \frac{P(a) \rightarrow Q(v) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \exists_r \\
 \frac{\exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\forall x \exists y(P(x) \rightarrow Q(y)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \exists_I \\
 \frac{\forall x \exists y(P(x) \rightarrow Q(y)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \text{cut}
 \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{P(a) \vdash P(a)}{P(a) \vdash P(a), Q(v)} w_r \\
 \frac{P(a) \vdash P(a), Q(v)}{\vdash P(a), P(a) \rightarrow Q(v)} \rightarrow_r \\
 \frac{\vdash P(a), P(a) \rightarrow Q(v)}{\vdash P(a), \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \exists_r \\
 \frac{\vdash P(a), \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\vdash Q(a)} \exists_r
 \end{array}
 \qquad
 \begin{array}{c}
 \frac{P(u) \vdash P(u) \quad Q(u) \vdash Q(u)}{P(u), P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash Q(u)} \rightarrow_I \\
 \frac{P(u), P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash Q(u)}{P(u), \forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash Q(u)} \forall_I \\
 \frac{P(u), \forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash Q(u)}{\vdash Q(a)} R
 \end{array}
 \qquad
 \begin{array}{c}
 \frac{Q(v) \vdash Q(v)}{Q(v), P(a) \vdash Q(v)} w_l \\
 \frac{Q(v), P(a) \vdash Q(v)}{Q(v) \vdash P(a) \rightarrow Q(v)} \rightarrow_r \\
 \frac{Q(v) \vdash P(a) \rightarrow Q(v)}{Q(v) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \exists_r \\
 \frac{Q(v) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\vdash} R
 \end{array}$$

Cut-Elimination by Resolution

An Example

$$\frac{
 \frac{
 \frac{
 \frac{P(u) \vdash P(u)}{} \rightarrow_l \quad \frac{Q(u) \vdash Q(u)}{} \rightarrow_l
 }{P(u), P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash Q(u)} \rightarrow_r
 }{P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash P(u) \rightarrow Q(u)} \rightarrow_r
 }{P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash \exists y(P(u) \rightarrow Q(y))} \exists_r
 }{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \exists y(P(u) \rightarrow Q(y))} \forall_l
 }{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \forall x \exists y(P(x) \rightarrow Q(y))} \forall_r
 }{
 \frac{
 \frac{
 \frac{
 \frac{P(a) \vdash P(a)}{} \rightarrow_l \quad \frac{Q(v) \vdash Q(v)}{} \rightarrow_l
 }{P(a), P(a) \rightarrow Q(v) \vdash Q(v)} \rightarrow_r
 }{P(a) \rightarrow Q(v) \vdash P(a) \rightarrow Q(v)} \rightarrow_r
 }{P(a) \rightarrow Q(v) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \exists_r
 }{\exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \exists_l
 }{\forall x \exists y(P(x) \rightarrow Q(y)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \forall_l
 }{\forall x \exists y(P(x) \rightarrow Q(y)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \text{cut}
 }{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))}$$

$$\frac{
 \frac{
 \frac{P(a) \vdash P(a)}{} \text{wr}
 }{P(a) \vdash P(a), Q(v)} \rightarrow_r
 }{\vdash P(a), P(a) \rightarrow Q(v)} \rightarrow_r
 }{\vdash P(a), \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \exists_r
 }{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash Q(a), \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))}
 }{
 \frac{
 \frac{
 \frac{
 \frac{P(u) \vdash P(u)}{} \rightarrow_l \quad \frac{Q(u) \vdash Q(u)}{} \rightarrow_l
 }{P(u), P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash Q(u)} \rightarrow_l
 }{P(u), \forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash Q(u)} \forall_l
 }{P(u), \forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash Q(a), \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} R
 }{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y)), \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))}
 }{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \text{cr}
 }{
 \frac{
 \frac{
 \frac{Q(v) \vdash Q(v)}{} \text{wl}
 }{Q(v), P(a) \vdash Q(v)} \rightarrow_r
 }{Q(v) \vdash P(a) \rightarrow Q(v)} \rightarrow_r
 }{Q(v) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \exists_r
 }{Q(v) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} R
 }{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))}$$

Cut-Elimination by Resolution

An Example

$$\frac{
 \frac{
 \frac{P(u) \vdash P(u) \quad Q(u) \vdash Q(u)}{P(u), P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash Q(u)} \rightarrow_i
 }{P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash P(u) \rightarrow Q(u)} \rightarrow_r
 }{P(u) \rightarrow Q(u) \vdash \exists y(P(u) \rightarrow Q(y))} \exists_r
 }{
 \frac{
 \frac{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \exists y(P(u) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \forall x \exists y(P(x) \rightarrow Q(y))} \forall_l
 }{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \forall x \exists y(P(x) \rightarrow Q(y))} \forall_r
 }{
 \frac{
 \frac{
 \frac{P(a) \vdash P(a) \quad Q(v) \vdash Q(v)}{P(a), P(a) \rightarrow Q(v) \vdash Q(v)} \rightarrow_i
 }{P(a) \rightarrow Q(v) \vdash P(a) \rightarrow Q(v)} \rightarrow_r
 }{P(a) \rightarrow Q(v) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \exists_r
 }{\exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \exists_l
 }{\forall x \exists y(P(x) \rightarrow Q(y)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \forall_l
 }{
 \frac{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \forall x \exists y(P(x) \rightarrow Q(y)) \quad \forall x \exists y(P(x) \rightarrow Q(y)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \text{cut}
 }$$

$$\frac{
 \frac{
 \frac{P(a) \vdash P(a)}{P(a) \vdash P(a), Q(a)} w_r
 }{\vdash P(a), P(a) \rightarrow Q(a)} \rightarrow_r
 }{\vdash P(a), \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \exists_r
 }{
 \frac{
 \frac{
 \frac{P(a) \vdash P(a) \quad Q(a) \vdash Q(a)}{P(a), P(a) \rightarrow Q(a) \vdash Q(a)} \rightarrow_i
 }{P(a), \forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash Q(a)} \forall_l
 }{
 \frac{
 \frac{Q(a) \vdash Q(a)}{Q(a), P(a) \vdash Q(a)} w_l
 }{Q(a) \vdash P(a) \rightarrow Q(a)} \rightarrow_r
 }{Q(a) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \exists_r
 }{
 \frac{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash Q(a), \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y)) \quad Q(a) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y)), \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} \text{cut}
 }{
 \frac{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y)), \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))}{\forall x(P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \vdash \exists y(P(a) \rightarrow Q(y))} c_r
 }$$

Atomic-Cut-Introduction by Resolution

A Few Interesting Facts about CERes

- ACNFs produced by Reductive methods have atomic cuts in the top of the proof (closer to leaves).
- ACNFs produced by CERes have atomic cuts in the bottom of the proof (closer to the root).
- If CERes is applied to a proof already in ACNF, but with cuts in the top, CERes produces a new ACNF with cuts in the bottom.
- The ACNF produced by CERes might be smaller than the original ACNF. (CERes is somehow capable of exploiting redundancies when pushing down the atomic cuts).
- This leads to a simple idea for atomic-cut-introduction (and possibly proof-compression) by resolution.

- The method **CIRes** for introducing atomic cuts in a *cut-free* proof φ follows the two steps below:

- 1 Obtain φ' by replacing every axiom-sequent $A \vdash A$ in φ by an atomic cut:

$$\frac{A \vdash A \quad A \vdash A}{A \vdash A} \text{ cut}$$

- 2 Apply CERes to φ' (thus obtaining a possibly compressed proof φ^* with atomic cuts in the bottom)

Testing the Method (can it really compress proofs?)

A Simple Example: $A \vee A \vdash A \wedge A$

A short proof ψ with cut (length 5, atomic size 26, symbolic size 32):

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{A \vdash A}{A \vee A \vdash A, A} \vee_l \quad \frac{A \vdash A}{A, A \vdash A \wedge A} \wedge_r}{A \vee A \vdash A} c_r \quad \frac{\frac{A \vdash A}{A, A \vdash A \wedge A} c_l \quad \frac{A \vdash A}{A \vdash A \wedge A} \wedge_r}{A \vee A \vdash A \wedge A} cut$$

One of the shortest proofs without cut, φ (length 6, atomic size 32, symbolic size 41):

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{A \vdash A}{A, A \vdash A \wedge A} \wedge_r \quad \frac{A \vdash A}{A \vdash A \wedge A} c_l}{A \vee A \vdash A \wedge A, A \wedge A} \vee_l \quad \frac{\frac{A \vdash A}{A, A \vdash A \wedge A} c_l \quad \frac{A \vdash A}{A \vdash A \wedge A} \wedge_r}{A \vee A \vdash A \wedge A} c_r$$

Can CIRes output ψ when given φ as input?

Testing the Method (can it really compress proofs?)

A Simple Example: $A \vee A \vdash A \wedge A$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\frac{\frac{A \vdash A}{-} \quad \frac{A \vdash A}{-}}{A \vdash A} \text{ cut} \quad \frac{\frac{A \vdash A}{-} \quad \frac{A \vdash A}{-}}{A \vdash A} \wedge_r \text{ cut}}{\frac{A, A \vdash A \wedge A}{A \vdash A \wedge A} c_l} \quad \frac{\frac{\frac{A \vdash A}{-} \quad \frac{A \vdash A}{-}}{A \vdash A} \text{ cut} \quad \frac{\frac{A \vdash A}{-} \quad \frac{A \vdash A}{-}}{A \vdash A} \wedge_r \text{ cut}}{\frac{A, A \vdash A \wedge A}{A \vdash A \wedge A} c_l} \vee_l \\
 \hline
 \frac{A \vee A \vdash A \wedge A, A \wedge A}{A \vee A \vdash A \wedge A} c_r
 \end{array}$$

$$\mathcal{S}_{\varphi'} \equiv ((A \oplus \neg A) \otimes^{**} (A \oplus \neg A)) \otimes^{***} ((A \oplus \neg A) \otimes^{**} (A \oplus \neg A))$$

Testing the Method (can it really compress proofs?)

A Simple Example: $A \vee A \vdash A \wedge A$

$$\frac{
 \frac{
 \frac{A \vdash A}{A \vdash A} \text{ cut} \quad \frac{A \vdash A}{A \vdash A} \text{ cut}
 }{A, A \vdash A \wedge A} c_l \quad
 \frac{
 \frac{A \vdash A}{A \vdash A} \wedge_r \quad \frac{A \vdash A}{A \vdash A} \text{ cut}
 }{A, A \vdash A \wedge A} c_l
 }{A \vee A \vdash A \wedge A, A \wedge A} c_r \quad
 \frac{
 \frac{
 \frac{A \vdash A}{A \vdash A} \text{ cut} \quad \frac{A \vdash A}{A \vdash A} \text{ cut}
 }{A, A \vdash A \wedge A} c_l \quad
 \frac{
 \frac{A \vdash A}{A \vdash A} \wedge_r \quad \frac{A \vdash A}{A \vdash A} \text{ cut}
 }{A, A \vdash A \wedge A} c_l
 }{A \vee A \vdash A \wedge A} v_l
 }{A \vee A \vdash A \wedge A} c_r$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 S_{\varphi'} &\equiv ((A \oplus \neg A) \otimes^{**} (A \oplus \neg A)) \otimes^{***} ((A \oplus \neg A) \otimes^{**} (A \oplus \neg A)) \\
 &\rightsquigarrow_{\otimes \otimes W} (A \oplus A \oplus (\neg A \otimes^{**} \neg A)) \otimes^{***} ((A \oplus \neg A) \otimes^{**} (A \oplus \neg A)) \\
 &\rightsquigarrow_{\otimes \otimes W} (A \oplus A \oplus (\neg A \otimes^{**} \neg A)) \otimes^{***} (A \oplus A \oplus (\neg A \otimes^{**} \neg A)) \\
 &\rightsquigarrow_{\otimes \otimes W} (A \otimes^{***} A) \oplus (A \otimes^{***} A) \oplus (A \otimes^{***} A) \oplus (A \otimes^{***} A) \oplus (\neg A \otimes^{**} \neg A) \oplus (\neg A \otimes^{**} \neg A)
 \end{aligned}$$

$$C_{\varphi'}^W \equiv \{ \vdash A, A ; \vdash A, A ; \vdash A, A ; \vdash A, A ; A, A \vdash ; A, A \vdash \}$$

Testing the Method (can it really compress proofs?)

A Simple Example: $A \vee A \vdash A \wedge A$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\frac{\frac{A \vdash A}{A \vdash A} \text{ cut} \quad \frac{A \vdash A}{A \vdash A} \text{ cut}}{A, A \vdash A \wedge A} c_l \quad \frac{\frac{A \vdash A}{A \vdash A} \wedge_r \quad \frac{A \vdash A}{A \vdash A} \text{ cut}}{A, A \vdash A \wedge A} c_l}{\frac{A \vee A \vdash A \wedge A, A \wedge A}{A \vee A \vdash A \wedge A} c_r} \\
 \frac{\frac{\frac{\frac{A \vdash A}{A \vdash A} \text{ cut} \quad \frac{A \vdash A}{A \vdash A} \text{ cut}}{A, A \vdash A \wedge A} c_l \quad \frac{\frac{A \vdash A}{A \vdash A} \wedge_r \quad \frac{A \vdash A}{A \vdash A} \text{ cut}}{A, A \vdash A \wedge A} c_l}{\frac{A \vee A \vdash A \wedge A, A \wedge A}{A \vee A \vdash A \wedge A} v_l}
 \end{array}$$

$$C_{\varphi'}^W \equiv \{ \vdash A, A ; \vdash A, A ; \vdash A, A ; \vdash A, A ; A, A \vdash ; A, A \vdash \}$$

δ :

$$\frac{\frac{\vdash A, A}{\vdash A} f_r \quad \frac{A, A \vdash}{A \vdash} f_l}{\vdash} R$$

Testing the Method (can it really compress proofs?)

A Simple Example: $A \vee A \vdash A \wedge A$

$$\frac{
 \frac{
 \frac{A \vdash A}{A \vdash A} \text{ cut} \quad \frac{A \vdash A}{A \vdash A} \text{ cut}
 }{
 \frac{A, A \vdash A \wedge A}{A \vdash A \wedge A} c_l
 }
 \frac{
 \frac{A \vee A \vdash A \wedge A, A \wedge A}{A \vee A \vdash A \wedge A} c_r
 }{
 \frac{A \vee A \vdash A \wedge A}{A \vee A \vdash A \wedge A} c_r
 }$$

$$\frac{
 \frac{\vdash A, A}{\vdash A} f_r \quad \frac{A, A \vdash}{A \vdash} f_l
 }{
 \vdash
 } R$$

$[\varphi']_{\vdash A, A}^O$:

$$\frac{A \vdash A \quad A \vdash A}{A \vee A \vdash A, A} \vee_l$$

$[\varphi']_{A, A \vdash}^O$:

$$\frac{A \vdash A \quad A \vdash A}{A, A \vdash A \wedge A} \wedge_r$$

Testing the Method (can it really compress proofs?)

A Simple Example: $A \vee A \vdash A \wedge A$

φ^* :

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{A \vdash A}{A \vee A \vdash A, A} \vee_l \quad \frac{A \vdash A}{A, A \vdash A \wedge A} \wedge_r}{A \vee A \vdash A} c_r \quad \frac{A \vee A \vdash A, A}{A \vdash A \wedge A} c_l}{A \vee A \vdash A \wedge A} cut$$

- Can CIRes output ψ when given φ as input?
 - Yes, φ^* equal to ψ !

- Consider the sequence of unsatisfiable sets of clauses:

$$T_m = \{\pm P^1 \vee \pm P_{\pm}^2 \vee \pm P_{\pm\pm}^3 \vee \dots \vee \pm P_{\pm\dots\pm}^m\}$$

- For example:

$$T_2 = \{P^1 \vee P_{+}^2, \neg P^1 \vee P_{-}^2, P^1 \vee \neg P_{+}^2, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P_{-}^2\}$$

- It is known (from [Cook-Reckhow, 1971]) that:
 - $|T_m|_s = s(m) \in O((2m)2^m)$.
 - $|\delta_m|_I = I_R(m) \in O(2^m)$, if δ_m is an optimal resolution refutation of T_m (or a sequent calculus refutation (*possibly with cuts*)).
 - $|\psi_m|_I = I_T(m) \in O(2^{2^{cm}})$, if ψ_m is an optimal tableaux refutation of T_m (or a *cut-free* sequent calculus refutation).

Testing the Method

A More Interesting Example

φ (length 17, atomic size 97, symbolic size 169):

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\frac{P^1 \vdash P^1}{P^1, \neg P^1 \vdash} \neg_I}{P^1, P^1, \neg P^1 \vee P^2, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2 \vdash} \neg_I \quad \frac{\frac{\frac{P^1 \vdash P^1}{P^1, \neg P^1 \vdash} \neg_I \quad \frac{P^2 \vdash P^2}{P^2, \neg P^2 \vdash} \neg_I}{P^2, P^1, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2 \vdash} \vee_I}{P^1, \neg P^1 \vee P^2, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2 \vdash} \vee_I \quad \frac{\frac{P^1 \vdash P^1}{P^1, \neg P^1 \vdash} \neg_I \quad \frac{\frac{P^2 \vdash P^2}{P^2, \neg P^2 \vdash} \neg_I}{P^2, P^1, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2 \vdash} \vee_I}{P^1, P^1, \neg P^1 \vee P^2, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2 \vdash} \vee_I \quad \frac{P^2 \vdash P^2}{P^2, \neg P^2 \vdash} \neg_I \\
 \frac{\frac{\frac{\frac{\frac{\frac{\frac{P^1 \vee P^2_+, \neg P^1 \vee P^2_-, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_-, P^1 \vee \neg P^2_+, \neg P^1 \vee P^2_-, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_-}{P^1 \vee P^2_+, \neg P^1 \vee P^2_-, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_-, P^1 \vee \neg P^2_+, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_-} \vee_I}{P^1 \vee P^2_+, \neg P^1 \vee P^2_-, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_-, P^1 \vee \neg P^2_+, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_-} \vee_I}{P^1 \vee P^2_+, \neg P^1 \vee P^2_-, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_-, P^1 \vee \neg P^2_+, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_-} \vee_I}{P^1 \vee P^2_+, \neg P^1 \vee P^2_-, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_-, P^1 \vee \neg P^2_+, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_-} \vee_I}{P^1 \vee P^2_+, \neg P^1 \vee P^2_-, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_-, P^1 \vee \neg P^2_+, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_-} \vee_I}{P^1 \vee P^2_+, \neg P^1 \vee P^2_-, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_-, P^1 \vee \neg P^2_+, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_-} \vee_I}
 \end{array}$$

Testing the Method

A More Interesting Example

φ^* (length 13, atomic size 70, symbolic size 105):

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\frac{P^1 \vdash P^1}{P^1 \vee P^2_+ \vdash P^1, P^2_+} \vee_I \quad \frac{\frac{P^2_+ \vdash P^2_+}{P^2_+, \neg P^2_+ \vdash} \neg_I}{P^2_+, P^1 \vee \neg P^2_+ \vdash P^1} \vee_I}{\frac{P^1 \vee P^2_+, P^1 \vee \neg P^2_+ \vdash P^1, P^1}{P^1 \vee P^2_+, P^1 \vee \neg P^2_+ \vdash P^1} \text{cr}} \text{cut} \\
 \frac{\frac{\frac{P^1 \vdash P^1}{P^1, \neg P^1 \vdash} \neg_I \quad \frac{P^2_- \vdash P^2_-}{P^2_-, P^1, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_- \vdash} \vee_I}{P^1, \neg P^1 \vee P^2_-, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_- \vdash} \vee_I}{\frac{P^1, P^1, \neg P^1 \vee P^2_-, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_- \vdash}{P^1, \neg P^1 \vee P^2_-, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_- \vdash} \text{cr}} \text{cut} \\
 \frac{\quad}{P^1 \vee P^2_+, P^1 \vee \neg P^2_+, \neg P^1 \vee P^2_-, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_- \vdash} \text{cut}
 \end{array}$$

φ (length 17, atomic size 97, symbolic size 169):

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\frac{P^1 \vdash P^1}{P^1, \neg P^1 \vdash} \neg_I \quad \frac{\frac{P^1 \vdash P^1}{P^1, \neg P^1 \vdash} \neg_I \quad \frac{P^2_- \vdash P^2_-}{P^2_-, \neg P^2_- \vdash} \neg_I}{P^2_-, P^1, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_- \vdash} \vee_I}{\frac{P^1, P^1, \neg P^1 \vee P^2_-, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_- \vdash}{P^1, \neg P^1 \vee P^2_-, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_- \vdash} \text{C}_1} \vee_I \\
 \frac{\frac{\frac{P^1 \vdash P^1}{P^1, \neg P^1 \vdash} \neg_I \quad \frac{P^2_- \vdash P^2_-}{P^2_-, \neg P^2_- \vdash} \neg_I}{P^2_-, P^1, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_- \vdash} \vee_I \quad \frac{\frac{P^1 \vdash P^1}{P^1, \neg P^1 \vdash} \neg_I \quad \frac{\frac{P^2_- \vdash P^2_-}{P^2_-, \neg P^2_- \vdash} \neg_I}{P^2_-, P^1, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_- \vdash} \vee_I}{\frac{P^1, P^1, \neg P^1 \vee P^2_-, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_- \vdash}{P^1, \neg P^1 \vee P^2_-, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_- \vdash} \text{C}_1} \vee_I}{\frac{P^1 \vee P^2_+, \neg P^1 \vee P^2_-, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_+, \neg P^1 \vee P^2_-, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_- \vdash}{P^1 \vee P^2_+, \neg P^1 \vee P^2_-, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_+, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_- \vdash} \text{C}_1} \vee_I \\
 \frac{\quad}{P^1 \vee P^2_+, \neg P^1 \vee P^2_-, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_+, \neg P^1 \vee P^2_-, \neg P^1 \vee \neg P^2_- \vdash} \text{C}_1
 \end{array}$$

- Enrich the clause set with more information from the cut-free proof, and use the additional information to constrain the search for refutations of the clause set.
- Try to extend the method so that *complex* propositional cuts could also be introduced. (This might be possible with a mixed structural clause form transformation of the cut-pertinent struct).
- Modify the concept of projection and modify how they are combined with the refutation, so that atomic cuts do not necessarily appear in the bottom of the proof.

- Thanks!
- An announcement: 24th of July, 18:00 (at ESSLLI SD09, in Bordeaux):
“Resolution Refinements for Cut-Elimination based on Reductive Methods”
- Questions? Comments? Suggestions?